



Architectural
Resources Group

**Historic Resources Memorandum
Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan**

**Architectural Resources Group
June 2018**

Table of Contents

1. Introduction and Methodology.....	1
2. Previous Historic Resource Surveys	1
3. Summary of Relevant Regulations	7

1. Introduction and Methodology

At the request of Angelo Planning Group, Architectural Resources Group (ARG) has developed this historic resources memorandum in support of the Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan. The memorandum compiles the findings of historic resource surveys conducted previously in the Plan Area, and summarizes relevant state and local regulations pertaining to historic resources.

To compile this memorandum, ARG participated in the kickoff meeting and Plan Area tour on May 11, reviewed the Clackamas County Cultural Resource Inventory, and reviewed historic resource-related materials created in conjunction with the draft City of Damascus Comprehensive Plan.

2. Previous Historic Resource Surveys

Clackamas County Cultural Resource Inventory

In 1984, Clackamas County completed a multi-volume, countywide cultural resource inventory that was intended to provide documentation of all significant cultural resources in the county. Expanded survey information regarding the identified properties was added to the inventory in 1989-90. Through this inventory, 36 historically significant properties were identified in the Happy Valley/Sunnyside/Damascus area, 6 of which are located within the Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan Area:

- James Akins House
18485 SE Foster Road
Style: Queen Anne Vernacular, c. 1880

- John Thomas House
17855 SE Foster Road
Style: Queen Anne Vernacular, c. 1880
- Troge House
19932 SE Foster Road
Style: Vernacular/Classical Revival, 1869
- John Byers Farm
15790 SE Hwy 224
Style: Queen Anne, 1895
- Carver School
16077 SE Hwy 224
Style: 20th Century Classical Revival, 1936-1940
- Henry Bock House (aka Feathers Residence)
18666 SE Highway 212
Style: Vernacular, 1880/1914

Two of these six properties – Carver School and the John Byers Farm – are designated Clackamas County Historic Landmarks.¹

Historical Background

In addition to property-specific information, the Inventory includes the following summary historical background information regarding the Happy Valley/Damascus area:²

Early development of the Happy Valley-Damascus area can be attributed to the proximity of the Barlow Road; the westernmost link of the Oregon Trail. The northern alignment of the Barlow Road, established by the 1850s, followed the north side of the Clackamas River and entered Oregon City via the present city of Gladstone. Early settlers were few and widely scattered and included Isaac Capps and Chevalier Richardson, who settled claims in the Rock Creek and Damascus areas, respectively.

Despite the seemingly heavy traffic through the study area, few early pioneers filed donation land claims. However, by the 1870s pioneers began to settle in the Happy Valley-Damascus area. Three factors are believed to have caused this development pattern. Oregon City held a strong attraction; many people stayed in this “urban” place and worked in the commercial or industrial establishments there. Pioneers interested in farming sought arable and accessible land near and along the navigable waterways, which were more dependable thoroughfares than the muddy, rutted roads of the period. Lastly, the topography of the Happy Valley area is hilly and therefore

¹ The Clackamas County Historic Review Board formally designates County Historic Landmarks based on their architectural, environmental, or historical significance according to the terms set forth in Section 707 of the Clackamas County Zoning and Development Ordinance.

² Clackamas County Historic Resources Inventory, *Happy Valley Sunnyside Damascus Area*, 1990. This historical overview is repeated in the contextual information included in the Inventory for each of the area’s 36 historically significant properties.

not well suited to the common agricultural practices of the mid-19th century. The population of the county at this time was primarily made of English, Irish and German emigrants, many of whom had lived in the Missouri, Mississippi or Ohio river valleys prior to moving westward to Oregon. These settlers chose first the level land and later developed the more hilly [sic] uplands areas.

Mid-19th century dwellings were often of log or simple wood-frame construction. Many buildings exhibited an influence of the Classical Revival style of architecture, although generally this influence was limited to symmetrical facade arrangements, and suggestions of a cornice at the eave line and corner boards.

Like their residential counterparts, agricultural buildings from the period were generally simple buildings. Due to the nature of farming practices, barns and sheds were low-profile, broad buildings.

After the Civil War (1865-1883), the area experienced slow but steady growth. The Barlow Road continued to be an important roadway, operating as a toll road through the first decade of the 20th century. Phillip Foster's Place, at present-day Eagle Creek, east of the study area, was an important point on the Barlow Road. Foster, who was a partner *in* the Barlow Road enterprise, sheltered traveling pioneers on the last leg of the trip. The road connecting Foster's Place with the road to the Columbia River, present day 82nd Avenue, as well as Milwaukie and Portland was established during the mid-19th century.

Communities sprung up along the early roadways throughout the historic period. Damascus, at the intersection of the Barlow Road and the road to Foster's Place, was one of those towns. The name Damascus apparently has biblical roots. A post office was established in Damascus in 1867 by Henry Pedigo. John S. Fisher was the first postmaster.

During the period following the Civil War, the construction of the Oregon-California Railroad may be considered the single most important event in the Happy Valley-Damascus area. In the late 1860s two factions set out to construct the line from Portland to Sacramento. One group selected the east side of the Willamette and the other took the west side. Whichever group reached the upper Willamette Valley first was to win the right to complete the line south. The east side line ran from Portland southward, skirting around Milwaukie and continuing south toward Oregon City, through the present community of Clackamas. The east side group won the competition and completed the line over the latter decades of the 19th century.

The town of Clackamas, originally named Marshfield, was platted in 1869-1870. The town grew up around the railroad stop and featured a post office and a number of businesses that catered to the farmers who populated the hinterlands.

During this period subsistence farming was the norm throughout the county, as well as in the Happy Valley-Damascus vicinity. Livestock and cereal grains were raised. Lumber complemented the rural economy. Kitchen gardens were essential. Towards the end of the period oats began to surpass wheat as the number one crop and potatoes attained the rank of number three crop. Increasing numbers of livestock corresponded with an increase in hay production. The total number of acres in cultivation tripled during the period. Further, improvements in farm practices and building technology caused changes to agricultural buildings.

Dwellings from the period were simple wood-frame buildings; many showed an influence, albeit watered down, from the Gothic Revival style of architecture. This type is commonly referred to as the Vernacular or Western Farmhouse style. In contrast to earlier dwellings the buildings of this period had a vertical emphasis; windows were taller and roof pitch was steeper. Drop siding was the most popular exterior wall material although some buildings were clad with the more primitive lap siding. Windows had multiple lights or panes. The windows of earlier buildings (circa 1860) typically had six lights or panes in each sash. As window glass became more readily available panes became larger and the number became fewer. By the end of the period four lights per sash were common.

In general, agricultural buildings continued to be low, broad buildings. However, beginning in the 1870s barns began to be taller to accommodate machinery, such as hay fork lifts.

During the Progressive Era (1884-1913) the population of Clackamas County tripled from 9,260 to almost 30,000, pushing the new comers to develop the hilly land well away from the river and the Barlow Road. By the turn-of-the-century wagon roads or “market roads” crossed the county, facilitating the transference of farm products to loading points along the railroad or to urban markets.

Interurban railroads also sought to fill the demand for better commuter and freight transportation, and entrepreneurs took advantage of the situation. Boring, named for the Jong time resident W.H. Boring, was one of towns which was established along an interurban railroad line. Boring Junction was platted in 1903, the year the interurban railroad line was constructed between Portland and Estacada. Estacada, located south of the Happy Valley-Damascus study area, was billed as a recreational spot, as well as the site of the power company dam on the Clackamas River.

While the Vernacular style continued to be the most popular architectural style in the Happy Valley-Damascus area between 1883 and 1913, in rare instances more elaborate styles were constructed. Some rural folk adapted modest forms of the highly decorative eclectic styles, such as the Queen Anne and Eastlake, popular in cities during the latter years of the 19th century. The availability of machine made ornament, such as turned posts and balustrades, jigsawn brackets, and patterned shingles, allowed a modicum of decorative treatments to be used on even the most remote farmhouse.

At the turn-of-the-century innovative American styles, such as the Craftsman-Bungalow, of architecture originated. The designers of this type rejected the machine-made ornament of the late Victorian period and instead, embraced a hand-crafted appearance and a more natural use of materials. This building type became the most popular through the early decades of the 20th century.

Agricultural buildings changed dramatically during the Progressive Era. By the turn-of-the-century barns had become quite tall. Most barns were equipped with devices to raise hay to a second or third floor or loft. Barns were designed in a variety of shapes, including Gambrel and Gothic Gambrel.

During the Motor Age (1914-1940) transportation improvements and growth in population continued to fuel agricultural activity. By the 1920s specialized crops, such as fruit and nut

cultivation, and dairying began to supplant general farming in the Happy Valley-Damascus vicinity.

Another interurban railroad line effected the development of the Happy Valley-Damascus study area in the early years of the 20th century. In 1915, Stephen S. Carver began to promote an interurban railroad line from Oregon City to south side of the Clackamas River. At the point the line crossed the river, Carver platted a town named for himself. This river crossing, known during the 19th century as Baker's Ferry, later Baker's Bridge and still later as Stone, became the Carver's townsite.

Horace Baker held the donation land claim for the area south of the river and operated the ferry until the early 1880s. The derivation of the name Stone has been explained two ways. According to Lewis McArthur, noted historical geographer, the name was established because of large boulders in the river. Another legend suggests that the place was named for Livingston Stone, first supervisor of the fish hatchery established here in the latter part of the 19th century. The fish hatchery was the first in Oregon and the second in the United States. In 1903, the hatchery was relocated to a point on the river south of Clackamas.

Throughout the county the Craftsman-Bungalow style continued to be the most popular style, although some period revival style buildings were constructed. After World War I, it was the influence of European architecture that inspired architects and builders to construct in the English Cottage and Tudor Revival styles. Concurrently, the Colonial Revival gained popularity. This style, as the name suggests, illustrated a strong sense a national pride.

Changes in agricultural buildings continued. Large barns were still constructed, but the most notable change was the introduction of buildings for large-scale specialized farming, such as dairying.

During the Depression the population remained constant and the towns remained as agricultural centers, but little construction occurred. Summer houses, built on the banks of the Clackamas River are the notable exception to the rule.

Since World War II, the Happy Valley-Damascus area has witnessed dramatic changes. Most noteworthy is the conversion of agricultural land to suburban residential subdivisions. The construction of the Interstate 205 freeway on the eastern periphery of the study area and the construction of the Clackamas Town Center/Promenade, etc. have stimulated a host of suburban development.

I-205 to Rock Creek Junction Survey

In 2007, additional historic resource survey work was conducted in the Plan Area by Archaeological Investigations Northwest (AINW) to fulfill federal requirements related to proposed roadway expansion and upgrades between I-205 and Rock Creek Junction.³ AINW identified 71 aboveground properties within the highway project area that were 45 years of age or older, including 8 located within the Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan Area, and 9 located outside of but adjacent to the

³ Archaeological Investigations Northwest, "Cultural Resources Technical Report, Sunrise Project: I-205 to Rock Creek Junction (Highway 212/224)," November 2007. The federal requirements were Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act (NHPA) and Section 4(f) of the Department of Transportation Act.

Plan Area. AINW did not find any of these 17 properties to be eligible for the National Register of Historic Places, generally due to loss of integrity and/or lack of architectural distinction.

Within the Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan Area

- 15690 SE Highway 212 (Martin Lehman House, 1926)
Survey evaluation: previously determined not eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP)
- 15528 SE Anderegg Parkway (residence, c. 1920)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity
- 17746 SE Highway 212 (residence, 1959)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 17780 SE Highway 212 (residence, 1925)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 17900 SE Highway 212 (garage, c. 1930)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 17920 SE Highway 212 (residence, 1930)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 17981 SE Highway 212 (residence, 1954)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 17785 SE Armstrong Circle (residence, 1925)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction

Adjacent to the Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan Area

- 15431 SE 152nd Drive (residence, 1925)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 15481 SE 152nd Drive (residence, 1948)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of architectural distinction
- 15221 SE Highway 212 (John Donaldson Residence, 1930)
Survey evaluation: previously determined not eligible for listing in the NRHP by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO)
- 15278 SE Highway 224 (residence, 1935)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to lack of architectural distinction
- 15302 SE Highway 224 (residence, 1936)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to lack of architectural distinction

- 16409 SE Highway 212 (Svendsen-Brown Farmstead, c. 1910)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of distinction
- 16631 SE Highway 212 (Mirrell Newell House, 1925)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity and lack of distinction
- 17141 SE Armstrong Circle (residence, 1945)
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to a loss of integrity
- 15951 SE Highway 212
Survey evaluation: not eligible due to lack of integrity and architectural distinction

3. Summary of Relevant Regulations

Clackamas County Preservation Ordinance

Until such time as the Pleasant Valley/North Carver Comprehensive Plan is formally adopted, all parcels within the Plan Area are subject to the Clackamas County Zoning and Development Ordinance. Section 707 of this ordinance specifies the definitions, review procedures, and permitted uses for the County's historic landmarks, historic districts, historic corridors and contributing resources. In the event that any identified historic resources within the Plan Area (including any of the six identified above in Section 2) are annexed by the City of Happy Valley, the City's Historic Properties Overlay Zone (described below) should be extended to those properties.

Happy Valley Comprehensive Plan and Development Code

The City of Happy Valley Comprehensive Plan establishes policies related to the protection of historic resources. The policies are part of Chapter 3 of the Comprehensive Plan (Natural Environment) and implement Statewide Planning Goal 5. There are two specific policies pertaining to historic resources:

NE-1.5: Maintain an inventory of the location, quality, and quantity of open space, scenic areas and historic sites to be managed in the development process.

NE-1.8: Protect any identified significant historic resources from inappropriate development.

Taken together, the policies call for the city to both identify historic resources in an inventory and to protect those historic resources from "inappropriate development". The policies are implemented by the Land Development Code ("development code"), which is Title 16 of the Happy Valley Municipal Code). The development code includes a Historic Properties Overlay Zone (Chapter 16.33). The purpose of the overlay zone is as follows (Section 16.33.010)

The description and purpose of this overlay zone is to keep and protect features within the City that reflect the City's special and historical heritage in order to:

- A. Safeguard the City's heritage as embodied and reflected in such features;*
- B. Encourage public awareness and knowledge of the City's history and culture;*
- C. Foster pride and a sense of identity with Happy Valley as a place;*
- D. Identify and resolve conflicts between the preservation of cultural resources and alternative land uses.*

The Historic Properties Overlay Zone is applied to a property through a quasi-judicial procedure, consistent with procedures for other types of plan amendments (see Chapter 16.67). The overlay zone establishes evaluation criteria or factors that must be considered by the Planning Commission in determining that a property is worthy of protection. Properties that receive the designation are then subject to special permitting requirements that are intended to protect the property from inappropriate development actions. These permitting requirements include:

- All exterior modifications must be reviewed by the Planning Commission. Approval of an exterior modification to the property must meet approval criteria associated with retention of original construction; height; bulk; visual integrity; scale and proportion; materials, colors and textures; and signing and lighting.
- Demolition of protected properties must be approved by City Council in a public hearing. Approval of a demolition must meet approval criteria that the original designation of the property was made in error, the resource is no longer significant, or the property owner is bearing “unfair economic burden” to maintain the historic resource.

Oregon Statewide Planning Goal 5

Oregon Statewide Planning Goal 5 stipulates that “[l]ocal governments shall adopt programs that will protect natural resources and conserve scenic, historic, and open space resources for present and future generations.” In support of this goal, local governments and state agencies are encouraged to maintain current inventories of historic resources; open space; and scenic views and sites.⁴

OAR 660-023-0200

The Oregon Land Conservation and Development Commission (LCDC) is charged by the Oregon Legislature with adopting, maintaining, and enforcing statewide planning goals to carry out the land use policies of the state. LCDC’s rules regarding implementation of the Statewide Land Use Planning Goals are known as “Oregon Administrative Rules” or “OAR.” The Goal 5 implementing rules regarding historic resources are set forth in OAR 660-023-0200. LCDC completed revisions to these rules in 2017 that:

- address inconsistencies in the application of Goal 5 at the local level;
- identify the baseline standards and procedures for inventorying and designating historic resources;
- outline the basic public process for the implementation of local protection measures; and
- clarify who constitutes an “owner” for purposes of the owner consent law.

According to these rules, jurisdictions are encouraged, but not required, to have a preservation ordinance and to adopt local historic inventory and designation processes. In developing historic preservation programs, local jurisdictions are encouraged to adopt historic preservation ordinances that are consistent with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and Guidelines for Archeology and Historic Preservation*. In conjunction with creating a historic resource inventory, local jurisdictions are encouraged to develop a local historic context statement and adopt a historic preservation plan.

⁴ Much of this Goal 5 rule summary is adapted from State Historic Preservation Office, “Planning for Historic Preservation in Oregon: A Guide to the Administrative Rule for Protecting Historic Resources under Statewide Planning Goal 5,” February 2018.

Required Protection: Demolition Review

Perhaps the most significant aspect of the 2017 Goal 5 rule changes is the establishment of a required demolition review process for properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places.⁵ Regardless of whether or not it has adopted a preservation ordinance, a local government must hold a public hearing to consider a demolition request. (“Demolition” is defined as any act that destroys, removes, or relocates, in whole or part, a significant historic resource “such that its historic character or significance is lost,” unless local plan and regulations contain a different definition.) The rule provides no specific requirements regarding the conduct of the hearing, so a local government can follow its normal procedures for a quasi-judicial land use hearing.

The new rules also identify a list of “factors” for the decision-making body to consider when hearing the request to demolish or relocate a resource. These factors include condition, historic integrity, age, historic significance, value to the community, economic consequences, design or construction rarity, and consistency with comprehensive plan. Demolition of accessory structures or non-contributing properties within a historic district are excluded from these review requirements. Ultimately, the local government may approve, approve with conditions (such as institution of a 120-day demolition delay to provide interested parties an opportunity to consider alternatives to demolition), or deny the request for demolition or relocation.

Supplemental Protections

For any resources designated to the National Register after February 10, 2017, a public hearing is required to impose any protections beyond demolition review. For example, adoption of design guidelines for a National Register-listed historic district that was listed after February 10, 2017 would require a public hearing.

Inventory v. Designation

In particular, the revised Goal 5 rules better differentiate between *inventorying* historic resources and *designating* historic resources. A *historic resource inventory* is a list of properties the historic significance of which have been evaluated based on site reconnaissance or other research. As such, creating or updating a historic resource inventory:

- Does not require a public hearing.
- Can be done without owner consent and a property may remain on the inventory notwithstanding owner objection.
- Is based on consideration of whether the resource satisfies one or more National Register or local significance criteria.

The Goal 5 rules encourage inventories be completed in accordance with standards and guidelines established by the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) and be provided to that office in a format compatible with the Oregon Historic Sites Database.

By contrast, *historic resource designation* is the process by which regulations are applied to a specific property or set of properties that have been included in an inventory. As a result:

⁵ At the time this report was completed, the Plan Area did not include any properties listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

- Designation is considered a land use decision requiring notice and public hearing.
- Local jurisdictions must allow owners to refuse historic designation at any time in the designation process.
- Local jurisdictions must adopt land use regulations if they want to protect locally significant historic resources.

OAR 660-023-0200 includes a detailed definition of who constitutes an “owner” for purposes of owner consent. If a property owner withholds consent for designation of a locally significant resource, the local government is prohibited from approving a request to demolish or modify the resource for at least 120 days after the owner’s refusal to consent to designation.

Oregon Revised Statute 358.653

Oregon Revised Statute (ORS) 358.653 obligates state agencies and political subdivisions of the state—including counties, cities, universities, school districts, and local taxing districts—to consult with the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) to avoid and/or mitigate impacts to historic properties for which they are responsible. Any property listed on the National Register of Historic Places or that appears eligible for listing qualifies as a historic property for purposes of this statute.

To comply with ORS 358.653, the City of Happy Valley would consult with SHPO regarding any project that involves modification of a publicly-owned property greater than 50 years of age, or any public project that involves modification of a property greater than 50 years of age. (Unless the property has previously been formally surveyed and found ineligible, in which case consultation is not required.) The focus of this consultation would be three-fold: (1) to determine whether the affected property possesses historic significance and, if so, possesses sufficient integrity to convey that significance; (2) to determine whether the proposed project would adversely impact the property’s significance (if it is significant); and (3) to identify project modifications or other measures that would avoid, reduce or mitigate for identified impacts.

Additional information about the SHPO consultation process is available on the SHPO website.⁶

⁶ Oregon State Historic Preservation Office, “Federal and State Compliance for Historic and Archaeological Resources,” https://www.oregon.gov/oprd/HCD/SHPO/pages/preservation_106.aspx, accessed June 22, 2018.